

Mount Atkinson-Tarneit Plains Infrastructure Contributions Plan (ICP) – Melton Amendment C201

CONCLAVE OF EXPERTS – COST ESTIMATES

‘POST’ CONCLAVE STATEMENT

Conclave Held: 12 June 2019, 3:15pm-4:30pm.

Location: Cardno, Level 4, 501 Swanston Street, Melbourne.

Attendees (12 June 2019 Conclave):

- Stephen Howe, Viraj Abeykoon – Cardno
- Anthony Grodzki – Urban Design & Management
- Sian McKenna – WT Partnership

1 Our discussion focussed on our respective expert reports in regard to the following matters:

1.1 Points of agreement during the conclave

- a) After discussion of matters raised in the relevant expert witness statements, it was agreed by the experts that the latest recommended changes to the ICP rates related to C201 would be accepted by all parties for finalising costings for the following items:
- Road projects RD-01, RD-02, RD-03, RD-04, RD-05, RD-06, RD-07, RD-08, RD-09, RD-10, RD-11, and RD-12. This is on the proviso that the corrected road lengths be used by the VPA in conjunction with these rates to finalise the costings per road project. Rate agreed summarised in appendix 1.
- b) It was also agreed by the experts that the latest recommended changes to ICP total cost estimates related to C201 would be accepted by all parties for the following items (these estimates are summarised in appendix 1):
- Intersection projects IT-01, IT-02, IT-03, IT-04, IT-05, IT-07, IT-08, IT-13, IT-14, and IT-15;
 - Bridge Project BR-03.

Signatures of Experts confirming agreement on items 1.1 a) and b):

Stephen Howe  Date: 26.06.2019

Anthony Grodzki Date:

Sian McKenna Date:

1.2 Points of agreement 'post conclave'


- a) Bridge project BR-02: The recommended cost has been updated upon re-examination of Cardno's previous estimate. Design assumptions and costs were clarified with the experts for:
- Anti-throw screens;
 - Bridge clearances over the rail line;
 - Concrete substructure sizing;
 - Superstructure Steelwork fabricated cost per tonne.

Following clarification and several discussions around these items, Cardno has revised its estimate for BR-02 to \$7,186,000 and WT Partnership has revised their estimate to \$7,394,000. The resulting cost difference is 2.8% placing it within the agreed (\pm)5% threshold. Due to this the revised estimate of \$7,186,000 has been agreed by all parties.

- b) Discussion was held regarding Culvert project CU-01. Cardno has re-examined and clarified design assumptions and costs for wing wall thicknesses, steel reinforcing rates and structural fill provision. Following this task, both Cardno and WT Partnership have revised their estimates to \$1,180,000 (Cardno) and \$1,224,000 (WT Partnership). The resulting cost difference is 3.7% placing it within the agreed (\pm)5% threshold. Due to this the revised estimate of \$1,180,000 has been agreed by all parties.
- c) Discussion was held regarding intersection project IT-16. Cardno has recommended in its expert witness statement dated 6 June 2019, section 5.2 that the final cost to be applied be amended from the 'recommended changes' amount of \$5,539,000 to \$5,329,000, correcting a typographical error which occurred in translating Cardno's costing application into the information displayed on the VPA website (WT Partnership estimate for IT-16 is \$5,473,380 resulting in a difference of 2.7% and placing in within the agreed (\pm)5% threshold).
- d) Discussion was held regarding Intersection project IT-09. Cardno has recommended in its expert witness statement dated 6 June 2019, section 5.3 that the final cost to be applied be amended from the 'recommended changes' amount of \$4,041,453M to \$3,411,000, correcting a typographical error which occurred in the line item for 'site preparation' in Cardno's costing application for the information displayed on the VPA website (WT Partnership estimate for IT-09 is \$3,292,040 resulting in a difference of 3.6% and placing the corrected Cardno estimate within the agreed (\pm)5% threshold).
- e) Discussion was held regarding the concept plan for Intersection project IT-06. It was noted that the IT-06 concept plan in the recommended changes to panel document is an older revision of the concept plan in Cardno's Recommended Changes - Results Application – 12 April 2019 (D04) document. The concept plan for IT-06 in Cardno's 12 April 2019 document should be used in the final ICP.
- f) Discussion was held regarding the estimate for Intersection project IT-06. Following the revision of quantities for several items from both Cardno and WT Partnership, the updated estimates are \$4,161,000 (Cardno) and \$4,351,591 (WT Partnership). The resulting cost difference is 4.38% placing it within the agreed (\pm)5% threshold. Due to this the revised estimate of \$4,161,000 has been agreed by all parties.
- g) Following the verification of the pavement quantities listed in Cardno's cost estimates, (pavement hatching plans were supplied by Cardno after the conclave with VPA approval) it was agreed by the experts that the latest recommended changes to ICP cost estimates related to C201 could be accepted by all parties for the following items:
- Intersection projects IT-10, IT-11, IT-12.

- h) The final cost estimates to be used in the Mt Atkinson Tarneit Plains ICP are summarised in appendix 1.

Signatures of Experts confirming agreement (if relevant) on items 1.2 a), b), c), d), e), f), and g):

Stephen Howe  Date: 26.06.2019


Anthony Grodzki Date:

Sian McKenna Date:

1.3 Points of current remaining disagreement

- a) No outstanding points of disagreement between the experts regarding cost estimates in the changes recommended to panel documents:

Signatures of Experts confirming agreement (if relevant) on items 1.3 a):

Stephen Howe  Date: 26.06.2019

Anthony Grodzki Date:

Sian McKenna Date:

APPENDIX 1 – AGREED COST ESTIMATES

Intersection	Estimate	Comments
RD-01 to RD-12 (inclusive)	\$4,375/m	No change required to the latest recommended changes to ICP rate, total estimates to be updated based on revised road lengths
IT-01	\$9,310,000	No change required to the latest recommended changes to ICP cost estimates
IT-02	\$5,936,000	
IT-03	\$4,972,000	
IT-04	\$4,765,000	
IT-05	\$3,372,000	
IT-06	\$4,161,000	
IT-07	\$3,270,000	No change required to the latest recommended changes to ICP cost estimates
IT-08	\$3,428,000	
IT-09	\$3,411,000	Update required to the latest recommended changes to ICP cost estimates
IT-10	\$4,088,000	No change required to the latest recommended changes to ICP cost estimates
IT-11	\$5,052,000	
IT-12	\$4,859,000	
IT-13	\$4,818,000	
IT-14	\$4,857,000	
IT-15	\$3,627,000	
IT-16	\$5,329,000	Update required to the latest recommended changes to ICP document
BR-02	\$7,186,000	Update required to the latest recommended changes to ICP cost estimates
BR-03	\$1,005,000	No change required to the latest recommended changes to ICP cost estimates
CU-01	\$1,180,000	Update required to the latest recommended changes to ICP cost estimates